

Monday, March 25th, 2002 8:30 AM  
New School University  
66 West 12<sup>th</sup> Street, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Orozco Room

## MINUTES

1. Tim Ettenheim, Associate Dean of the Milano Graduate School at New School University, welcomed us to the Orozco Room at New School University.
2. Bob Yaro brought our attention to the newly issued “Report of Proceedings” from the February 7 Listening to the City Forum at South Street Seaport.
  - 2.1. Arthur Fried, Director of Center for Excellence in New York City Governance summarized the report:
    - 2.1.1. One theme that ran through out the forum and is evident in the proceedings is the theme of Social and Economic Justice
    - 2.1.2. Participants stressed that it was important to recognize all victims of the attack, even low-wage earners and non-documented workers.
    - 2.1.3. The Listening the City conference is just the beginning our efforts in gathering public input.
    - 2.1.4. We are planning another “mega-public forum,” Listening to the City II, in July or September.
3. Eva Hanhardt, of the Municipal Art Society reported on the progress of the Imagine New York outreach project.
  - 3.1. Forums have begun across the five boroughs in three languages: English, Chinese, and Spanish.
  - 3.2. There will be 150 forums in total, of which 40 are open to the public. For more information, visit [www.imaginenewyork.org](http://www.imaginenewyork.org).
4. Steve Brigham, of AmericaSpeaks announced that they will be putting out Requests for Proposals (RFPs) in the next week for Listening to the City II for the following positions: Outreach coordinator, Public Relations, Events Coordinator, and A/V.
  - 4.1. If anyone in the Civic Alliance knows of companies or individuals who would be interested in these positions and would like to receive the RFP, please email Steve Brigham. ([sbrigham@americaspeaks.org](mailto:sbrigham@americaspeaks.org))
5. Steve Weber of RPA gave an update on the state of the Civic Alliance’s draft Planning Framework. The Civic Alliance is preparing a draft to be ready in time for the Regional Assembly on April 26. C.A. Working Groups should begin preparing their chapters, which should be approximately 4000 words in length. We hope that each working group can prepare a chapter describing their work and the recommendations they are making. These chapters should consider cross-cutting issues that may overlap with the work of other groups. They should also begin thinking about what graphics, maps, charts and images they might include in these chapters.

- 5.1. Alex Marshall, a journalist, is the new “Senior Editor” at RPA and for the Civic Alliance. Alex will be on hand to edit and help write the chapters going into the Planning Framework.
- 5.2. Working Group chairs should submit an outline of their chapter, or as much material as they have complete, by April 1. They should submit a draft chapter by (at the latest) April 12. The earlier they submit their chapters, the more Alex will be available to them to assist in writing and editing. You may reach Alex Marshall by email at [Alex@rpa.org](mailto:Alex@rpa.org).
6. Chris Jones, Director of Economic Programs at RPA introduced today’s topic: Economic Development. He gave a Power Point Presentation that summarized the work and scope of the Civic Alliance working group on Economic Development. You may view the Power Point at [www.civic-alliance.org](http://www.civic-alliance.org).
7. David Kallick, of the Fiscal Policy Institute spoke next. He made the following points:
  - 7.1. There is a tension between downtown economic development and city-wide development.
  - 7.2. Who are the people who lost their jobs in this disaster? They were primarily:
    - 7.2.1. Apparel industry
    - 7.2.2. Building Services
    - 7.2.3. Air Transport industry
    - 7.2.4. Retail services
    - 7.2.5. 60% of jobs lost were low-income workers with an average hourly wage of \$11.00
  - 7.3. Less than half of the people who worked downtown lived downtown.
  - 7.4. It is important to recognize that Chinatown was a severely impacted community.
  - 7.5. Taxi cab industry, apparel, graphic designers all lost business, without necessarily going out of business, or losing their jobs.
  - 7.6. The impacts of this disaster were spread out among the entire region.
  - 7.7. Schools are an important way to get people to live and work downtown. He paraphrased Carl Weisbrod as saying, “PS 231 was the most important economic development project downtown.”
  - 7.8. We must perpetuate the “virtuous cycle” of **good schools** leading to **good housing** leading to **good transportation**.
  - 7.9. Doctoroff apparently said recently that “Lower Manhattan is a priority; there is little we can do to turn around low-skill industries at this time.” Kallick finds this statement disturbing, and thinks we must make a priority of enabling upward mobility for low-skilled workers.
  - 7.10. \$2.7 billion federal dollars have been promised for economic development, of which \$700,000 has already been allocated.
  - 7.11. We can use some of this money for changing low-skilled jobs to middle-skilled jobs, for “sectoral strategy”, for publicly subsidized jobs, and for job training.
8. Steve Sasala, former President and CEO of Prosperity New Jersey spoke next. He summarized a recent meeting that took place in Newark with leaders of the Civic Alliance and important business and government leaders of New Jersey. He made the following points:

- 8.1. New Jersey's economic success is inextricably linked to that of New York City.
  - 8.1.1. At this point it is unclear whether relocations are permanent or temporary.
  - 8.1.2. Companies are looking to 'spread their eggs.'
  - 8.1.3. Before 9/11, there was already redundancy of headquarters in different cities within the region.
  - 8.1.4. Northern New Jersey has actually fared better than NY during the recession.
  - 8.1.5. In the 90's, Northern New Jersey added 20% more office space than New York did.
- 8.2. Regional Collaboration is linked to the success of the entire region.
  - 8.2.1. Rebuilding must occur with the full cooperation of New Jersey.
  - 8.2.2. The role of the Port Authority must be clarified.
  - 8.2.3. We need to increase trans-Hudson capacity.
  - 8.2.4. New Jersey's transportation is New York-centric.
  - 8.2.5. New York must continue to be the heart and soul of the region.
- 8.3. Choices for business location are global: the Tri-state region is competing against an international market.
  - 8.3.1. Intra-regional competition can be destructive. (As difficult as we know it is to change.)
  - 8.3.2. We should explore the potential for a meeting of the three governors and the New York Mayor at a tri-state regional leadership forum and proceed in the spirit of cooperation and collaboration.
9. Ernest Tollerson, of New York City Partnership spoke next and raised the following points:
  - 9.1. NY City Partnership is at the early stage in the next phase of their study, after an initial study of impacts released in November.
  - 9.2. The November study said that the future of downtown redevelopment was mixed-use, probably somewhere between the 2<sup>nd</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> scenarios described in Chris Jones' presentation.
  - 9.3. Three committees of CEO's and investors have come together to discuss the following infrastructure issues: rapid transit, telecommunications, and energy.
  - 9.4. NYC is often lagging behind other world competitors in the quality of its infrastructure.
  - 9.5. Pre-9/11, Lower Manhattan was a live/work 24/7 neighborhood.
  - 9.6. What will drive economic development in L.M. in the future? We need to start looking at new options, new sectors. We should not assume that what we have relied upon in the past will drive the economy in the future.
  - 9.7. Two sectors with strong potential for Downtown are industries that will develop the next phase of new information technologies, and foreign companies that need a New York location to anchor international activities.
  - 9.8. Bio-tech could be the next sector to grow in NYC, and Downtown might be a good location for firms that develop its commercial applications.
  - 9.9. Re-authorization of TEA-21 (T-3) is important to transportation improvements.
  - 9.10. Our competitors are world cities like London and cities in Asia.
  - 9.11. I hope that an event like 9/11 will lead the region to rethink AirTrain, which should be a one-seat ride.

- 9.12. We need to use public investments in infrastructure to leverage private investment.
- 9.13. Lower Manhattan was a cheaper-rent district than Midtown Manhattan. It is important for New York to have a lower-cost Central Business District to provide a wider choice of office space.
- 9.14. The highest and best use of federal money will be to leverage sectors.
10. Questions and comments from the floor:
  - 10.1. Maurice Paprin, Business Labor Community Coalition:
    - 10.1.1. The voice of labor is missing from this discourse.
  - 10.2. Paul Elston, New York League of Conservation Voters:
    - 10.2.1. Decision makers who decide where to locate their companies look for good places.
    - 10.2.2. I urge you to include the need to make Lower Manhattan a great place to live and work one of the priorities.
    - 10.2.3. Also: energy efficiency and the possibility for distributed generation are important to look at.
  - 10.3. Tollerson response: The Partnership is aware of the energy issue. We have an interest in distributed generation and high performance buildings.
    - 10.3.1. Schools are an important aspect of making the location an attractive place to locate.
  - 10.4. Ron Shiffman, PICCED:
    - 10.4.1. Where are the public statements from the Partnership or L.M.D.C. that federal money should be used for infrastructure to leverage private investment, instead of subsidies?
    - 10.4.2. Nor have there been public statements about governmental cooperative compacts.
  - 10.5. Tollerson: The Partnership is working on a statement about the subsidy and public infrastructure issue.
  - 10.6. Steve Sasala: for governmental cooperation, the first and best common ground is transportation.
  - 10.7. Beverly Willis, R.Dot: We should consider making housing available in Manhattan to low-wage workers so they too can have the convenience of walking to work, instead of grueling commutes. This would ease the burden on transportation systems as well.
  - 10.8. Joan Byron, PICCED: What can the Civic Alliance do to take the public position that federal money should be going to infrastructure, not hand-outs?
  - 10.9. Barry Benepe, New York Fine Arts Federation: How are people from Long Island and Eastern New York City getting to companies that have relocated to New Jersey?
  - 10.10. Bob Yaro: with extreme difficulty.
  - 10.11. Eva Hanhardt: I am pleased to see you are looking at different sector analysis. From the disaster, the inter-connectedness of different sectors became apparent. Will you be looking at sectors broadly across the city to address this?
  - 10.12. Jones response: We will be looking at Downtown in the context of the city and region, but are unlikely to have the resources to develop sector strategies for the region as a whole.

- 10.13. Joe Weisbord, Housing First! : Drawing from the earlier example used of Ft. Collins, Colorado as place that has attracted businesses to locate, a big factor in that is the cheapness of housing costs. Especially for sectors that do not compensate at Wall Street salaries, the amenity of living in Lower Manhattan is lower when the housing cost is very high.
- 10.14. Michael Bradley, Riverside South Development Corporation: How does re-imposing the commuter tax play into this? Is it really politically viable?
- 10.14.1. Numerous people questioned that this would be a major burden on NJ's commuters. However, perhaps congestion pricing on East River bridges, from which funds would be directly applied to transportation improvements, is a better alternative.
- 10.15. Jeff Zupan, RPA: Do we have any research on the types of jobs or businesses that have relocated to Midtown versus in outer boroughs or outside of New York City?
- 10.15.1. Also: What are you assuming about the Stock Exchange?
- 10.15.2. Does the Civic Alliance want to address the issues of the far West Side?
- 10.16. Jones Response: There are some data and indications that the larger firms have relocated to a larger extent than smaller ones, and we are working on a better data base. We have not yet made any assumptions on the Stock Exchange for any of the scenarios.
- 10.17. Paul Elston: I bet there will be a great increase in tourism in Lower Manhattan. Could that industry overwhelm the area?
11. At approximately 10:10 AM, the meeting adjourned.

#### Attendance

Arthur Fried	Center for Excellence in New York City Governance
Barry Benepe	Fine Arts Federation of NY
Bernard Goetz	
Bettina Damiani	Good Jobs New York
Beverly Willis	R.DOT
Bob Kull	
Bonnie Harken	American Planning Association, New York Chapter
Bruce Rosen	NYC Department of City Planning
Carla van de Walle	
Chris Jones	RPA
David Dyssegaard Kallick	Fiscal Policy Institute
David Herman	
Edward Falterman	American Society for Public Administration
Ellie King	Womens City Club
Elston, Paul	NY League of Conservation Voters
Ernest Tollerson	New York City Partnership
Eva Handhardt	Municipal Art Society
Falterman, Ed	American Society Public Administration
Gabrielle Brainard	Kiss + Cathcart Architects

George Penesis	Konheim & Ketcham
Grace Han	Columbia University
J. Bunka	
Jan Nicholson	RPA
Jeff Zupan	RPA
Joan Byron	PICCED
Joe Weisbord	Housing First!
Kate Schmidt	Manhattan Borough President's Office
Katherine Brower	Permanent Citizens Advisory Committee (PCAC) to the MTA
Kelly Robinson	Rutgers University
Laurie Beckelman	Guggenheim Museum
Leena Shanbhag	PICCED
Leevi Kill	American Institute of Architects, New York Chapter
Mary Davis	NOW Legal Defense Fund
Maurice Paprin	Business Labor Community Coalition
Michael Bradley	Riverside South Planning Corporation
Nicole Brown	NOW Legal Defense Fund
Parkinson Pino	Cultural Renewal
Paul Elston	NY League of Conservation Voters
Paula Crespo	PICCED
Peggy Shiller	
Peter Marcuse	Columbia University
Petra Todorovich	RPA
Rick Bell	American Institute of Architects, New York Chapter
Rob Lane	RPA
Robert D. Yaro	RPA
Roger Herz	TIME/ To Improve Municipal Efficiency
Ron Shiffman	PICCED
Sandy Hance	
Sandy Hornic	NYC Department of Planning
Shirley Jaffe	Alliance for Downtown New York
Shirley Secunda	
Steve Brigham	AmericaSpeaks
Steve Sasala	Prosperity New Jersey
Steve Weber	RPA
Tara Colton	Center for Excellence in New York City Governance
Tim Ettenheim	New School University
Tom Dallessio	RPA
Tova Wang	Century Foundation
Toya Williford	RPA