

DRAFT

Regional Transit to Lower Manhattan

*Initial recommendations for a
transportation plan for Lower
Manhattan*

**Presentation for Discussion to the
Civic Alliance to Rebuild Downtown**

11-12-02

Jeffrey M. Zupan

Objectives

- Rebuild what was destroyed
- Upgrade better and quickly to restore confidence
- Create a more attractive environment for travel to and within Lower Manhattan
- Provide improved access from poorly served markets within and beyond Manhattan

Categories of Transportation Improvements

- In this presentation
 - Short-term transit improvements
 - Longer-term transit improvements
 - Off-site transit improvements within Lower Manhattan
- Future presentations
 - Improvements related to the design of the WTC site
 - Treatment of West Street
 - Street Management
 - Fulton Street Corridor

Short-Term Recommendations for Regional Travel to Lower Manhattan

- To gain access to LM for more markets to make it more competitive with other areas
 - Expanded ferry service
 - Long Island City to LM
 - Demonstration of subsidized ferries
 - Battery Marine Terminal
 - Shorter term subway improvements
 - J train express
 - Train to the AirTrain to the Plane
 - Pedestrian corridor at Grand Central to Lexington Avenue line

Short-term Ferry Service

- Lower Manhattan is ideal for ferries with waterfront a short walk to most destinations
- Numerous opportunities for relatively quick and inexpensive projects to assist access to Lower Manhattan.
 - LIRR to Long Island City and ferry to LM
 - Low subsidies for new services to keep fares down can create new ferry options for locations in Brooklyn, Queens, and Yonkers
 - Use of Battery Marine Terminal for new ferry services

Recommendations: LIRR upgrade facilities and service in LIC. NYC should begin a demonstration of subsidized ferry service. Study of Battery Marine Terminal should be undertaken to accommodate added services.

Short-term Subway Improvements

- Creating express service on J line to LM possible using third track on some segments; reportedly, MTA is studying
- Kennedy Airport's AirTrain will be connected to Howard Beach and A train soon; could provide interim good quality two-seat ride to Kennedy Airport

Recommendation: Support MTA's look at J train; support marketing of the 21 Century "trains to the planes"

New Pedestrian Connection from Grand Central Terminal to Lexington Avenue Line

- A new corridor to connect the lower level of Grand Central Terminal (GCT) to the Lexington Avenue line.
- Shortens walk to only subway at GCT to Lower Manhattan, making trip easier for suburban commuters
- *Recommendation: Recommended for early implementation*

Longer-term Recommendations for Regional Travel to Lower Manhattan

- PATH Extension to Newark Airport
- Regional Rail

PATH Extension to Newark Airport

- PATH in downtown Newark is about two miles from new Northeast Corridor station outside airport.
- Port Authority has begun study of cost and feasibility.
- In past, Port Authority concluded that it would be disruptive of PATH service
- *Recommendation: Once Port Authority study complete it should be compared with other regional transportation investments to set priorities*

Needed: Long-Term Solution for Regional Rail Access to Lower Manhattan

- LM long been at a competitive disadvantage because of absence of direct one-seat ride from suburbs
- Seek to improve access from all locations where substantial numbers of employees reside, especially those in top management positions.
 - Westchester and Connecticut
 - Long Island
 - Upper East Side
 - Upper West Side
 - New Jersey

Regional Rail

- Second Avenue Subway
- Brookfield Proposal
- RPA's MetroLink

Second Avenue Subway

- After much lobbying by RPA and others (before 9/11), MTA agreed to extend the Second Avenue Subway (SAS) to Lower Manhattan, probably under Water Street
- SAS would provide two new services and decongest a third
 - Via Second Avenue and under Water Street
 - Via Second Avenue and into N/R Broadway line
 - Would decongest Lexington Avenue line, improving commute from upper east side and for Metro North commuters
 - Relieves West Side subways too
- Funds for SAS are uncertain

Brookfield Properties Proposal

- Proposed as relatively inexpensive and quicker to implement solution for access to LM
- Two-seat, transit service for LI commuters to LM using the Atlantic Branch of LIRR
- Brookfield would plug into existing A/C tracks and tunnel under the East River
- Brookfield estimates cost of \$1.9 billion and time to complete of 5 years
- MTA studying proposal for impacts on existing subway riders; results not available yet
- RPA analysis suggests:
 - time savings for Long Islanders would be small
 - would speed trip from Kennedy to LM considerably

MetroLink

- RPA's MetroLink proposal is an extension of the Second Avenue Subway:
 - Uses Atlantic Branch of the LIRR to serve Long Island commuters and create a one-seat ride to LM from Kennedy Airport
 - Links to Grand Central Terminal to serve Metro North commuters
 - Relieves crowding on Lexington Avenue and west side subway
 - A new tunnel under the East River connects to Second Avenue Subway in LM
 - MetroLink might be built from the south first, speeding up timetable for LM relief
 - Incremental cost over Brookfield Proposal could be relatively small

All Could Combine Best Features of Commuter Rail and Rapid Transit with Hybrid Vehicle Design

- Paris – RER and Meteor Line
- London – Jubilee Line
- Tokyo

How to Make a Decision on Best Long-Term Solution for Regional Rail Access to Lower Manhattan

Recommendation: Use a portion of the \$250 million of FEMA funds to perform a definitive study of the best way to improve access.

Recommendation: Support study of funding options using new revenue sources such as East River tolls, MTA congestion pricing, other fees and taxes for LM and other transit improvements.

Recommendations Within Lower Manhattan

- To assist Lower Manhattan by giving the public confidence that it is recovering; and
- To make Lower Manhattan a more pleasant and lively place
 - Transit Centers
 - Fulton/Broadway subway complex redesign
 - PATH station complex
 - Goods movement and waste removal
 - South Ferry station reconfiguration
 - Rector Connector

Transit Centers

- Two major clusters of subway lines exist in the vicinity of the WTC site and they will not be moved
- One is off the WTC site at Fulton/Broadway, consisting of 4/5, A/C, 2/3, and J/M/Z
- The other cluster is the on WTC site, consisting of PATH, 1/9, N/R, and E
- Each must be designed to:
 - create a sense of arrival and orientation
 - strong and inviting presence at surface
 - easier pedestrian movement among all stations
 - a more attractive environment

Concourse

- Pedestrian concourse designed to connect PATH/WTC and Fulton/Broadway
- Considerations
 - Design for passengers and goods/trash
 - Extend river to river, possibly along Fulton Street corridor

MTA's Fulton/Broadway Complex

- MTA has redesigned Fulton/Broadway complex with street entrance on east side of Broadway
- Design intended to simplify maze-like underground, but designs have not been made public

Recommendation: conditionally support redesign, subject to full briefing. Ask MTA to examine the cost and feasibility of extending underground concourse under Fulton Street to Water Street

PATH Complex and Permanent PATH station under the WTC Site

- Design of interconnecting facilities must await plans for the entire site
- Location of permanent PATH station at interim location is less costly than relocating it nearer Church Street
- Moving station to the east does not appear to shorten average walking distances
- LMDC architects' designs may influence location

Recommendation: Conditionally support permanent station at same location as interim, while seeking cost data from Port Authority and await LMDC-sponsored designs on the off-chance it could affect this recommendation.

Goods Movement and Waste Removal

- New development offers opportunity for new thinking
- Reliance on trucks is environmentally undesirable

Recommendations: Port Authority should evaluate concourse for goods and waste removal; integrate within and beyond WTC site; include consideration of extended concourse, use of barges and PATH

LMDC and NYC should evaluate goods movement and waste removal systems for all of LM.

South Ferry Station

- Poor design today at 1/9 station result of tight loop, which limits ability to leave both trains and station, creates hazards, reduces train capacity and adds to passenger delay
- Straightening out loop would solve each of these problems, speeding access to LM from the West Side by 10 minutes, and create a no-fare transfer with N/R at Whitehall station.
- Concerns expressed about impact on Battery Park

Recommendation: construct the station, but minimize impacts on Battery Park.

Rector Connector

- Two stations are very close on adjacent blocks
- Connecting them would improve trip between parts of Brooklyn and west side south of Greenwich Village
- ADA requirements would make station accessible
- Beneficial project, but tangential to LM recovery

Recommendation: support the project.

Future Recommendations at WTC Site

- Depends on and to be informed by designs for site now under development by LMDC and Civic Alliance/RPA
 - Permanent PATH station
 - Transit center and concourse
 - West Street
 - Through streets on WTC superblock
 - Bus storage on or off WTC site

Future Amenity and Transportation Related Recommendations for Lower Manhattan

- **Fulton Street Corridor**
- **Street Management**